

Prosecuting Attorney Criminal Division Elise A. Deschenes, Chief Deputy Jason J. Cummings, Prosecuting Attorney

Mission Building, 1st Floor 3000 Rockefeller Ave., M/S 504 | Everett, WA 98201-4046 (425) 388-3333 | Fax (425) 388-3572 www.snoco.org

Date April 30, 2025

Supreme Court Rules Committee c/o Clerk of the Supreme Court Temple of Justice P.O. Box 40929 Olympia, WA 98504-0929 [sent via email at supreme@courts.wa.gov]

RE: Proposed Rule Change to CrR & CrRLJ 8.3(b)

To the members of the Rules Committee,

As the elected Prosecutor for Snohomish County I am once again writing to join those opposing the proposed changes to CrR & CrRLJ 8.3(b). Once again, the change to rule 8.3(b) proposed by the defense bar asks the court to significantly expand the power of courts while significantly diminishing the powers of the other two co-equal branches of government. This rule change also has the potential to trample on crime victim rights.

I object to this proposed change to rule 8.3(b) because as currently written the rule already reasonably balances society's interest in protection of the public through laws enacted by the Legislature and executed by the executive, while recognizing the court's important role in protecting an individual defendant's rights. Removing the requirement of "prejudice to the defendant's right to a fair trial" before a court can dismiss criminal charges unmoors the court from its proper role and is likely to lead to less consistency and the appearance of greater arbitrariness in application of the criminal law. While the current proposed rule provides some factors the court is to consider when deciding motions made under CrR 8.3(b)/CrRLJ 8.3(b), they are so arbitrary and subjective they do not provide sufficient protection against an extension of the court's reach in Legislative and executive powers.

Courts are not designed for, or well suited to, exercising executive authority. To maintain the integrity of the criminal justice system, courts must demonstrate restraint in expanding their own powers. The Washington Supreme Court has recognized the vital role of the Prosecutor:

The charging discretion of prosecuting attorneys is an integral part of the constitutional checks and balances that make up our criminal justice system. Each branch of government plays a distinct role: the legislature checks prosecutors and the judiciary by defining the particular acts and circumstances that may warrant criminal punishment and the maximum sentences that may be imposed; prosecutors check the power of the legislature and the judiciary by deciding whom to charge and which available charges and special allegations to file in any given

case; and the judiciary checks the legislature and prosecutors by reviewing probable cause, ensuring a fair trial, and determining the appropriate sentence if the defendant is found guilty.

State v. Rice, 174 Wn. 2d 884, 889 (2012).

The Washington State Supreme Court has a long history of recognizing prejudice to the defendant's right to a fair trial as a requirement before the court may take the extraordinary step of dismissing a criminal charge. Dismissal is an extraordinary remedy. *State v. Wilson*, 149 Wn.2d 1, 12 (2003). Even before the change to rule 8.3(b) in 1995 adding the language the defense bar now seeks to strike, the court recognized that prejudice to the defendant's right to a fair trial was a common law prerequisite to dismissal of criminal charges by the courts. *State v. Michielli*, 132 Wn.2d 229, 239 (1997). *Michielli* found the added language about prejudice to a defendant's right to a fair trial to be an insubstantial change since it merely reflected preexisting common law requirements for dismissing charges.

Under the current court rule a defendant has the burden to show by a preponderance of the evidence arbitrary action or governmental misconduct. Governmental misconduct has been interpreted to include any form of "mismanagement" as well as affirmative misconduct or arbitrary action. *State v. Blackwell*, 120 Wn.2d 822, 830 (1993). Without a prejudice requirement, a court could dismiss any charge no matter how serious if it simply concludes that some form of mismanagement occurred during the police investigation, at the crime lab, or during any phase of the prosecution even when there is no impact on the defendant's rights. This could easily result in inconsistent outcomes for defendants and unjust results for crime victims.

As this Court did last year with a very similar proposal from the defense bar, please reject the proposed rule change to 8.3(b). The factors suggested in this year's iteration of the defense preferred rule change are insufficient to address the longstanding rule that Court's should not dismiss criminal charges when there is no prejudice to the defendant.

Respectfully,

Jason Cummings

Snohomish County Prosecuting Attorney

Administration Division Michael C Held, Chief of Staff Robert J. Drewel Bldg., 7th Floor (425) 388-7002 Fax (425) 388-3083 Civil Division Bridget Casey, Chief Deputy Robert J. Drewel Bldg., 8th Floor (425) 388-6330 Fax (425) 388-6333 Family Support Division Julie Mohr, Chief Deputy Robert J. Drewel Bldg., 6th Floor (425) 388-7280 Fax (425) 388-7295

OFFICE RECEPTIONIST, CLERK
Farino, Amber
Ward, David
FW: Rulemaking Comments on CrR/CrRLJ 8.3(b)
Wednesday, April 30, 2025 3:23:17 PM
<u>0764_001.pdf</u>

From: Cummings, Jason <Jason.Cummings@co.snohomish.wa.us>
Sent: Wednesday, April 30, 2025 3:21 PM
To: OFFICE RECEPTIONIST, CLERK <SUPREME@COURTS.WA.GOV>
Cc: Cummings, Jason <Jason.Cummings@co.snohomish.wa.us>
Subject: Rulemaking Comments on CrR/CrRLJ 8.3(b)

You don't often get email from <u>jason.cummings@co.snohomish.wa.us</u>. <u>Learn why this is important</u> **External Email Warning!** This email has originated from outside of the Washington State Courts Network. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender, are expecting the email, and know the content is safe. If a link sends you to a website where you are asked to validate using your Account and Password, <u>DO NOT DO SO!</u> Instead, report the incident.

Attached please find my comment on the above referenced proposed rules.

Thank you,

Jason J. Cummings Prosecuting Attorney Snohomish County Prosecuting Attorney's Office 3000 Rockefeller Avenue, M/S 504 Everett,WA 98201-4046 phone: (425) 388-6332 fax: (425) 388-6333 email: jcummings@cco.snohomish.wa.us

NOTICE: All emails, and attachments, sent to and from Snohomish County are public records and may be subject to disclosure pursuant to the Public Records Act (Chapter 42.56 RCW).

CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT: This message may contain information that is protected by the attorney-client and/or work product privilege. If this message was sent to you in error, any use, disclosure or distribution of its contents is prohibited. If you receive this message in error, please contact me at the telephone number or e-mail address listed above and <u>delete this message</u> without printing, copying, or forwarding it. Thank you.